



## Literacy

# GRADE 11-12 LITERACY IN ENGLISH LANGUAGE ARTS: ARE HUMANS GOOD OR EVIL?

## UNIT OVERVIEW

Students will examine the writings of Hobbes and Rousseau to gain a deeper understanding of their divergent viewpoints on human nature. They will apply Hobbes's and Rousseau's ideas in analyzing various literary works in preparation for the final assessment. For their final product, students will read "The Hollow Men" and make an informed argument, supported by evidence, connecting the ideas expressed in this text to the ideas expressed by one of the Enlightenment thinkers.

## TASK DETAILS

**Task Name:** Are Humans Good or Evil?

**Grade:** 11-12

**Subject:** Literacy

**Depth of Knowledge:** 4

**Task Description:** Students write an essay answering the question: according to T.S. Eliot, are humans good or evil? In their essay, students argue which side they think Eliot takes. In their argument, they explain whether Eliot's thesis is supported by the ideas of either Hobbes or Rousseau. They also address the counterclaim (in other words, explaining why the other enlightenment thinker's ideas do not support Eliot's thesis). Students use evidence from "The Hollow Men," *The Social Contract*, and *Leviathan* to support their assertions.

### Standards Assessed:

RI.11-12.1: Cite strong and thorough textual evidence to support analysis of what the text says explicitly, as well as inferences drawn from the text, including determining where the text leaves matters uncertain.

W.11-12.1: Write arguments to support claims in an analysis of substantive topics or texts, using valid reasoning and relevant and sufficient evidence.

- a. Introduce precise, knowledgeable claim(s), establish the significance of the claim(s), distinguish the claim(s) from alternate or opposing claims, and create an organization that logically sequences claim(s), counterclaims, reasons, and evidence.
- b. Develop claim(s) and counterclaims fairly and thoroughly, supplying the most relevant evidence for each while pointing out the strengths and limitations of both in a manner that anticipates the audience's knowledge level, concerns, values, and possible biases.

- c. Use words, phrases, and clauses as well as varied syntax to link the major sections of the text, create cohesion, and clarify the relationships between claim(s) and reasons, between reasons and evidence, and between claim(s) and counterclaims.
- d. Establish and maintain a formal style and objective tone while attending to the norms and conventions of the discipline in which the student is writing.
- e. Provide a concluding statement or section that follows from and supports the argument presented.

**Materials Needed:**

- Hobbes, Thomas, and C. B. Macpherson. *Leviathan*. London: Penguin, 1988. Print. Chapter 13.
- Rousseau, Jean-Jacques. *The Social Contract and Other Later Political Writings*. Edited and translated by Victor Gourevitch. Cambridge, U.K.: Cambridge University Press, 1997. Part 1.
- Eliot, T.S. *Selected Poems*. Orlando, Florida: Harcourt Brace & Company, 1930. Print.



## TABLE OF CONTENTS

The task and instructional supports in the following pages are designed to help educators understand and implement Common Core–aligned tasks that are embedded in a unit of instruction. We have learned through our pilot work that focusing instruction on units anchored in rigorous Common Core–aligned assessments drives significant shifts in curriculum and pedagogy. Callout boxes and Universal Design for Learning (UDL) supports are included to provide ideas around how to include multiple entry points for diverse learners.

|   |       |
|---|-------|
| <b>PERFORMANCE TASK: ARE HUMANS GOOD OR EVIL?</b> | ..... |
| <b>RUBRIC</b>                                     | ..... |
| <b>ANNOTATED STUDENT WORK</b>                     | ..... |
| <b>INSTRUCTIONAL SUPPORTS</b>                     | ..... |
| <b>UNIT OUTLINE</b>                               | ..... |
| <b>INSTRUCTIONAL SUPPORTS</b>                     | ..... |

Acknowledgements: This unit was developed by Stephanie Iannuzzi and Hayley Heffernan at Washington Irving High School in NYC, and reviewed for CCLS alignment by the Common Core Fellows.



# GRADE 11-12 LITERACY IN ENGLISH LANGUAGE ARTS: ARE HUMANS GOOD OR EVIL?

## PERFORMANCE TASK

## Human Nature: Good or Evil? – Final Assessment Task

### Directions: Are humans inherently good or evil?

According to T.S. Eliot, are humans good or evil? In your essay, argue which side you think Eliot takes. Explain whether Eliot's thesis is supported by the ideas of either Hobbes or Rousseau. Please also address the counterclaim (in other words, explaining why the other enlightenment thinker's ideas do not support Eliot's thesis). Use evidence from "The Hollow Men," *The Social Contract*, and *Leviathan* to support your assertions.

### You MUST include the following elements in your paper:

#### Argument

- ☐ Establish the significance of a precise, knowledgeable claim regarding Eliot's thesis about human nature in his poem "The Hollow Men"
- ☐ Establish the significance of a precise, knowledgeable claim regarding which philosopher Eliot is most similar to. Choose either Rousseau or Hobbes and connect their ideas to "The Hollow Men"
- ☐ Identify areas in which Eliot may leave matters uncertain
- ☐ Address, develop, and disprove the counterclaim
- ☐ Provide relevant and sufficient evidence to support your claim (see below for more details)
- ☐ Establish and maintain a formal style and objective tone in your writing

#### Textual Evidence

- ☐ Specific references to "The Hollow Men" to support your identification of Eliot's thesis
- ☐ Specific references to Rousseau's *Social Contract* and Hobbes's *Leviathan* to support your claim and refute the counterclaim
  - ☐ Include at least two quotes that connect to your claim and explain the relevance
  - ☐ Include at least two quote that connect to the counterclaim and disprove them
- ☐ Specific references to Eliot's "The Hollow Men" to support your claim and refute the counterclaim
  - ☐ Include at least three quotes and explain how the ideas presented in these quotes connect to either Rousseau or Hobbes

#### Valid Reasoning

- ☐ For each quote, you will need to analyze and support what "Hollow Men" says explicitly as well as inferences drawn from the text, including determining where the text leaves matters uncertain
- ☐ For each quote, you will need to link back to the argument presented in your claim. You should discuss whether these examples link to the ideas of Rousseau or Hobbes. Provide valid reasoning for your assertions
- ☐ You must explain each quote in at least 2 to 3 sentences

#### Structure

- ☐ You should use words, phrases, clauses, and varied syntax to link major sections of the text, creating cohesion and a logical organization that clarifies relationships between claim(s), counterclaim(s), reasons, and evidence
- ☐ You should cite each quote using MLA style



# GRADE **11-12** LITERACY IN ENGLISH LANGUAGE ARTS: ARE HUMANS GOOD OR EVIL?

## RUBRIC

# ARGUMENTATIVE ESSAY RUBRIC

|                               | Exemplary   |    | Proficient  |    | Developing  |    | Rewrite  |    |    |    |
|-------------------------------|---|----|---|----|---|----|--|----|----|----|
| Introduction                  | <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>You have introduced Eliot’s claim about human nature with precision, knowledge, and significance.</li><li>You have clearly articulated which Enlightenment thinker Eliot most resembles.</li></ul>  |    | <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>You have clearly identified Eliot’s claim about human nature.</li><li>You have articulated which Enlightenment thinker Eliot most resembles.</li></ul>  |    | <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>You have somewhat identified Eliot’s claim about human nature.</li><li>You have somewhat articulated which Enlightenment thinker Eliot most resembles.</li></ul>  |    | <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>You have not identified or misinterpreted Eliot’s claim about human nature.</li><li>You have not identified or misinterpreted which Enlightenment thinker Eliot most resembles.</li></ul>  |    |    |    |
| Assign Points                 | 20  | 19 | 18  | 17 | 16  | 15 | 14   | 13 | 12 | 11 |
| Arguments                     | <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>In your topic sentence, you have clearly connected Eliot’s thesis with one of the Enlightenment thinkers.</li><li>You have provided strong and thorough evidence to prove your assertions about Eliot.</li><li>You have provided strong and thorough evidence from either author and have analyzed this evidence to prove your assertions about their connection.</li></ul> |    | <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>In your topic sentence, you have connected Eliot’s thesis with one of the Enlightenment thinkers.</li><li>You have provided evidence to prove your assertions about Eliot.</li><li>You have provided evidence from each author and have used this evidence to prove your assertions about their connection.</li></ul> |    | <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>In your topic sentence, you have somewhat connected Eliot’s thesis with one of the Enlightenment thinkers.</li><li>You have tried to provide evidence to prove your assertions about Eliot.</li><li>You have tried to provide evidence from each author and have used this evidence to prove your assertions about their connection. Some evidence was used more effectively.</li></ul> |    | <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>Your topic sentence does not connect the two authors or is missing.</li><li>You have not provided adequate evidence to prove your assertions about Eliot.</li><li>You have not provided adequate evidence to prove your assertions about Eliot’s link to Hobbes or Rousseau.</li></ul>                           |    |    |    |
| Assign Points                 | 20  | 19 | 18  | 17 | 16  | 15 | 14   | 13 | 12 | 11 |
| Opposing view<br>(Other Side) | <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>In your topic sentence, you have clearly presented the counterclaim.</li><li>You have provided strong and thorough evidence from either author and have analyzed this evidence to disprove the counterclaim.</li></ul>  |    | <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>In your topic sentence, you have presented the counterclaim.</li><li>You have provided evidence from each author and have used this evidence to disprove the counterclaim.</li></ul>  |    | <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>In your topic sentence, you have somewhat presented the counterclaim.</li><li>You have tried to provide evidence from each author and have used this evidence to disprove the counterclaim. Some evidence was used more effectively.</li></ul>  |    | <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>Your topic sentence does not identify or misidentifies the counterclaim.</li><li>You have not provided adequate evidence to disprove the counterclaim.</li></ul>   |    |    |    |
| Assign Points                 | 20  | 19 | 18  | 17 | 16  | 15 | 14   | 13 | 12 | 11 |
| Conclusion                    | <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>You have clearly restated the claim.</li><li>You have effectively supported and summarized your argument.</li></ul>   |    | <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>You have restated the claim.</li><li>You have summarized your argument.</li></ul>   |    | <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>You have somewhat restated the claim.</li><li>You have somewhat summarized your argument.</li></ul>   |    | <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>You have not restated the claim.</li><li>You did not adequately summarize your argument.</li></ul>   |    |    |    |
| Assign Points                 | 20  | 19 | 18  | 17 | 16  | 15 | 14   | 13 | 12 | 11 |
| Conventions                   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>You have consistently maintained a formal style and objective tone.</li><li>Your grammar and usage are consistently accurate.</li><li>You have created a logical organization, demonstrating cohesion and clear relationships among major sections of the text.</li></ul>   |    | <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>You have mostly maintained a formal style and objective tone.</li><li>Your grammar and usage are mostly accurate.</li><li>You have created a logical organization, demonstrating some cohesion and relationships among major sections of the text.</li></ul>  |    | <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>You have sometimes maintained a formal style and objective tone.</li><li>Your grammar and usage are sometimes inaccurate; errors do not interfere with understanding.</li><li>You have created an organization, at times demonstrating cohesion, though weakly clarifying relationships among major sections of the text.</li></ul>   |    | <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>You have rarely maintained a formal style and objective tone.</li><li>Your grammar and usage are often inaccurate; errors interfere with understanding.</li><li>You have inconsistently created an organization, and have not demonstrated cohesion or relationships among major sections of the text.</li></ul> |    |    |    |
| Assign Points                 | 20  | 19 | 18  | 17 | 16  | 15 | 14   | 13 | 12 | 11 |

**Introduction** \_\_\_\_\_  
**Arguments** \_\_\_\_\_  
**Counterargument** \_\_\_\_\_  
**Conclusion** \_\_\_\_\_  
**Conventions** \_\_\_\_\_

**TOTAL SCORE (out of 100)** \_\_\_\_\_

**Comments and Next Steps:**



## GRADE **11-12** LITERACY IN ENGLISH LANGUAGE ARTS: ARE HUMANS GOOD OR EVIL?

### ANNOTATED STUDENT WORK

This section contains annotated student work at a range of score points and suggested next steps for students. The student work shows examples of student understandings and misunderstandings of the task.



## Student A- Developing

T.S. Eliot's thesis about human nature, in his poem, "The Hollow Men," he expresses human nature as emotionless and cold hearted. For example, in his first two stanzas, he characterizes men as hollow men that are made of straw, such as a scarecrow, which has no heart. He also describes men as colorless, formless, and no or low self-esteem. Eliot's views on human nature relates to Rousseau's views because they share their own perspective on human nature and they both don't have a leader basically. Eliot's views relates to Hobbes' views because they look at human nature and characterize it as a bad thing on mankind. They both basically believe that if you are strong, you should take advantage of that and control the weak. I believe that Eliot most resembles the philosopher Hobbes. I believe that because they both think alike.

I think that Eliot most resembles Hobbes because they think alike in many ways. They both have a negative point of view on mankind. They both believe that mankind tries to degrade each other every opportunity they get to show who's stronger and who is going to be in charge. For example, in Hobbes' *Leviathan*, paragraph six, it shows how men cannot be happy in interacting with each other if there is no larger power to put them in fear, respect, and/or wonder, so in other words, in awe. If there isn't any larger power to put them in awe, then Hobbes' then believes that men have three main reasons that cause them to fight. One is to compete with each other; the other is to disrespect each other and thirdly, is to feel accomplishment. These examples are shown in Hobbes' *Leviathan* paragraph 7. In Eliot's poem, "The Hollow Men", he writes about how the narrator is one group of heartless, self-centered

**Comment [1]:** A claim is introduced. While student uses language such as "a bad thing on mankind," he/she does not directly answer the task question.  
[W.11-12.1.a]

**Comment [2]:** Textual evidence in support of the claim  
[RI.11-12.1]

**Comment [3]:** Informal style  
[W.11-12.1.d]

**Comment [4]:** Informal style  
[W.11-12.1.d]

**Comment [5]:** Student identifies the philosopher that connects to *Hollow Men* but does not provide a precise claim i.e. "they both think alike."  
[RI.11-12.1]

**Comment [6]:** Informal style  
[W.11-12.1.d]

**Comment [7]:**  
Development of claim  
[W.11-12.1.b]

**Comment [8]:**  
Development of claim, explicit evidence from text  
[W.11-12.1.b]

men in which between the poem, instead of it referring to a 'we', it then changes to 'I'. This symbolizes how all the men are put together and are as one unified group who basically has the same perspective on things throughout the poem. Therefore, this concludes my belief of Eliot resembling Hobbes because of their similar ways of thinking on mankind.

**Comment [9]:**  
Student identifies quotations from both works to support claim but does not explain the underlying reasoning that connects the evidence to the claim.  
[RI.11-12.1]  
[W.11-12.1.b]

**Comment [10]:**  
Inference based on textual evidence  
[RI.11-12.1]

Some people, in the other hand, might find that Eliot most resembles Jean Jacques Rousseau. I think otherwise, yet I could see why they might think that. For example, in part III paragraph 7, Rousseau explains how might does not, in fact, equal right and that there should be a leader, just not one that has their followers following them by force and fear, but by choice. In Eliot's, "The Hollow Men", the narrators are praying to a power, that happens to be stronger than they are, yet the power isn't listening to the men because he is stronger so he doesn't have to, but it is still not right. See, there is flaw that contradicts this resemblance between Rousseau and Eliot because although the men are praying to a larger power, the hollow men do not leave or break the contract like Rousseau would suggest.

**Comment [11]:**  
Student introduces a counterclaim.  
[W.11-12.1.b]

**Comment [12]:** Analysis lacks textual evidence and needs more development to support reasoning  
[RI.11-12.1]

**Comment [13]:** Informal style  
[W.11-12.1.d]

In conclusion, the enlightenment thinker in which Eliot resembles the most is Thomas Hobbes. This would be because their perspectives, ways of thinking, and words are very much similar with each other, as to where Rousseau and Eliot might have a bit of resemblance, yet there's most likely going to be something that proves Rousseau and Eliot's resemblance incorrect. Therefore, I conclude that Eliot is more like Hobbes than Rousseau.

**Comment [14]:** Student provides a concluding statement that summarizes his/her argument.  
[W.11-12.1.e]

**Grading:**

Introduction: 15

Arguments: 15

Counterargument: 15

Conclusion: 17

Conventions: 15

Total Score: 77

The student's analysis of the materials and the construction of his/her argument are sophisticated and nuanced. He/she clearly states Eliot's claim about human nature and provides evidence to support his/her assertion. He/she connects Eliot's thesis to an Enlightenment thinker and provides evidence for that connection. He/she presents a counterargument and provides evidence to argue against the counterargument. He/she provides a conclusion that meets the standard. Student will need support in developing his/her reasoning to more clearly defend his/her claims and explain the underlying assumptions that connect the evidence/quotations to the claims. Student could also practice evaluating evidence and including quotations that more clearly supports his/her argument. There are some errors in conventions that create minor confusion in the clarity of the student's ideas. Furthermore, the student does not establish and maintain a formal style and objective tone throughout the paper.

## Student B- Developing

In the "The Hollow Men" T.S. Eliot argues that humans are evil. Evidence is shown that they're evil when they speak about death's dream kingdom. His views on human nature relate to Hobbes because Hobbes believes that humans are evil and live by their desires and only want to do what they want to and need a government to regulate people. An example to show that Hollow Men are malevolent when he says, "Violent souls, but only as the Hollow Men, the stuffed men." This means that these people who were once alive have turned into evil souls, they're bad, that's why they're hollow, because they don't have minds or hearts. Another example is when the author says "In death's other kingdom walking alone, at the hour when we are trembling with tenderness." This means that they're in death's dream kingdom. The hollow men are suffering for the bad things they've done. They are afraid and forever alone. Therefore, Hobbes is the philosopher that mostly resembles Eliot's argument on human nature.

According to Hobbes and T.S. Eliot humans are evil and irresponsible. An example of where Hobbes thinks humans are irresponsible is when he says, "when going to sleep, he locks his chests; and this this when he knows there be laws and public officers." Here Hobbes wants the reader to know that people don't trust each other. And without trust everything turns into a mess, that's why we need laws. Another example of where Hobbes thinks humans are evil and irresponsible, "Hereby it is manifest that during the time men live without common power to keep them all in awe, they are in that condition which is called war; and such a war as is of every man against every man." This quote reveals that there has to be someone in charge because if not everyone goes against each other and start war. Men need a strong leader who will have everything under control. Both Hobbes and T.S. Eliot both agree that humans are evil and irresponsible and will run everything if they have no one in charge.

**Comment [16]:** Formal style  
[W.11-12.1.d]

**Comment [15]:**  
Claim is introduced clearly  
[W.11-12.1.a]  
The reasoning to support the use of this quotation is not clear  
[W.11-12.1.a]

**Comment [17]:**  
Evidence to support claim  
[RI.11-12.1]

**Comment [18]:**  
Again student's reasoning is ambiguous  
[RI.11-12.1.b]

**Comment [19]:**  
Evidence should be cited to support this idea.  
Student does not support claim with evidence from Hobbes' text.  
[RI.11-12.1]  
[W.11-12.1.c]

**Comment [20]:**  
Restatement of claim  
[RI.11-12.1.b]

**Comment [22]:** Links major sections of text  
[W.11-12.1.c]

**Comment [21]:**  
Error in language creates confusion  
[RI.11-12.1]]

**Comment [23]:** Evidence should be cited to support this idea  
[RI.11-12.1]  
[W.11-12.1.c]

Conversely some might argue that Rousseau's ideas of human nature closely resembles T.S.

Elliot ideas. According to Rosseau humans have the ability to self govern, believes that people have the ability to self govern when he says, "But, as men cannot engender new forces, but only unite and direct existing ones, they have no other means of preserving themselves than the formation, by aggregation, of a sum of forces great enough to overcome the resistance." This quote reveals that when people become crazy they join together. T.S. Elliot disagrees with this quote when he writes, "The eyes are not here There are no eyes here in this valley of dying stars In this hollow valley," T.S. Elliot basically is saying how no one sees anything they are evil and regret it.

Therefore, Hobbes and T.S. Elliot both agree that humans are evil and responsible. As you can see in the examples Hobbes ideas of human nature resembles more to T.S. Elliot.

**Comment [24]:** Formal style  
[W.11-12.1.d]  
Links claim/counterclaim  
[W.11-12.1.c]

**Comment [25]:**  
Student's reasoning is not clear and indicates a misinterpretation of the quotation  
[RI.11-12.1]

**Comment [26]:**  
Claim lacks strong support  
[W.11-12.1.b]

**Comment [27]:**  
Concluding statement lacks development.  
[W.11-12.1e]

**Grading:**

Introduction: 15.5

Argument: 14

Counterargument: 13

Conclusion: 13

Conventions: 16

Total Score: 71.5

The student starts off strong, with a clear claim and with an attempt to include evidence to support that claim in the introduction. He/she specifies which Enlightenment thinker Eliot most resembles, adds evidence, and tries to connect that evidence to the claim. He/she needs to explain his/her ideas in greater detail. There are some misinterpretations of quotes in the second paragraph.

His/her counterclaim paragraph is too brief. He/she provides adequate evidence, but needs to pair it with equally strong analysis.

His/her conclusion also needs significant expansion. He/she somewhat restates his/her claim, but does not adequately summarize his/her argument. The student establishes and maintains an appropriate style and tone.



# GRADE 11-12 LITERACY IN ENGLISH LANGUAGE ARTS: ARE HUMANS GOOD OR EVIL?

## INSTRUCTIONAL SUPPORTS

The instructional supports on the following pages include a unit outline with formative assessments and suggested learning activities. Teachers may use this unit outline as it is described, integrate parts of it into a currently existing curriculum unit, or use it as a model or checklist for a currently existing unit on a different topic.

## Unit Outline

**INTRODUCTION:** This unit outline provides an example of how to integrate performance tasks into a unit. Teachers may (a) use this unit outline as it is described below; (b) integrate parts of it into a currently existing curriculum unit; or (c) use it as a model or checklist for a currently existing unit on a different topic. The length of the unit includes suggested time spent on the classroom instruction of lessons and administration of assessments. Please note that this framework does not include individual lessons.

### Grade 11-12 Literacy in English Language Arts: Are Humans Inherently Good or Evil?

#### UNIT TOPIC AND LENGTH:

- Duration: 3 to 4 weeks (90-minute blocks)
- Topic: Students will examine the writings of Hobbes and Rousseau to gain a deeper understanding of their divergent viewpoints on human nature. They will apply Hobbes's and Rousseau's ideas to various literary works in preparation for the final assessment. For their final product, students will read "The Hollow Men" and make an informed argument, supported by evidence, connecting Eliot to one of the Enlightenment thinkers.

#### COMMON CORE STANDARDS:

- R.I.11-12.1: Cite strong and thorough textual evidence to support analysis of what the text says explicitly, as well as inferences drawn from the text, including determining where the text leaves matters uncertain.
- W.11-12.1: Write arguments to support claims in an analysis of substantive topics or texts, using valid reasoning and relevant and sufficient evidence.
  - a) Introduce precise, knowledgeable claim(s), establish the significance of the claim(s), distinguish the claim(s) from alternate or opposing claims, and create an organization that logically sequences claim(s), counterclaims, reasons, and evidence.
  - b) Develop claim(s) and counterclaims fairly and thoroughly, supplying the most relevant evidence for each while pointing out the strengths and limitations of both in a manner that anticipates the audience's knowledge level, concerns, values, and possible biases.
  - c) Use words, phrases, and clauses as well as varied syntax to link the major sections of the text, create cohesion, and clarify the relationships between claim(s) and reasons, between reasons and evidence, and between claim(s) and counterclaims.
  - d) Establish and maintain a formal style and objective tone while attending to the norms and conventions of the discipline in which the student is writing.
  - e) Provide a concluding statement or section that follows from and supports the arguments presented.

#### BIG IDEAS/ENDURING UNDERSTANDINGS:

- The ability to see and connect arguments made in both literary and informational texts
- Complex ideas often do not easily fall into clear distinctions such as good or evil

#### ESSENTIAL QUESTIONS:

- Are humans essentially good or evil?
- How do poets and philosophers explore the role of government in our lives?



|  |  |
|--|--|
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>➤ Writers can successfully argue multiple positions</li> <li>➤ The use of evidence determines the degree to which an argument is convincing</li> </ul>  |  |
| <p><b>CONTENT:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>➤ Philosophies presented by Enlightenment thinkers Hobbes and Rousseau, and the poetry of T.S. Eliot, Robert Burns, and Wilfred Owen</li> <li>➤ The components of argumentative writing, specifically: how to make an argument, support it with evidence, appreciate the other side</li> </ul>   | <p><b>SKILLS:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>➤ The ability to read and assess complex texts</li> <li>➤ The ability to make an argument and support it with evidence</li> <li>➤ The ability to identify and develop multiple sides of an argument</li> <li>➤ Annotate both poetry and informational texts</li> <li>➤ Analyze the author’s argument and its development over the course of a text</li> <li>➤ Cite strong and thorough technical evidence from texts</li> </ul> |
| <p><b>VOCABULARY/KEY TERMS:</b></p> <p>Enlightenment, human nature, social contract, power</p>   |  |
| <p><b>ASSESSMENT EVIDENCE AND ACTIVITIES:</b></p> <p><b>INITIAL ASSESSMENT:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>➤ Students will complete an anticipation guide, agreeing or disagreeing with statements about human nature. Students will answer in Google Docs and classes will study the data from pie charts, writing an analysis of these initial responses.</li> </ul>   |  |
| <p><b>FORMATIVE ASSESSMENT:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>➤ Write an analysis of Burns’s “To a Mouse”. What is his thesis about power? What evidence does he use to prove his point? How do his views on power relate to Rousseau? You should use at least two examples to support your assertions.</li> <li>➤ Construct a cartoon that depicts the action in “Dulce et Decorum Est”, connecting it to the ideas presented in <i>Leviathan</i>. (see “Instructional Supports”)</li> </ul>   |  |
| <p><b>FINAL PERFORMANCE TASK:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>➤ According to Eliot, are humans good or evil? Identify Eliot’s thesis about man’s true nature. Write an argument in which you make a claim about which Enlightenment thinker Eliot is most similar to. Be sure also to address, develop, and disprove the counterclaim (in other words, explain why the other philosopher is not a good fit). You must use evidence from “The Hollow Men,” <i>The Social Contract</i>, and <i>Leviathan</i> to support your assertions.</li> </ul> |  |

## LEARNING PLAN & ACTIVITIES:

### *The Social Contract*

- Comprehension: Students will read through Chapter XIII of *The Social Contract* and annotate the development of the argument. Identify Rousseau's claim about human nature and outline his evidence.
- Significant Moments: Select and explain the moment that reveals the most about Rousseau's claim about human nature.
- Comprehension: Write a summary of Rousseau's *Social Contract*. What is his claim about human nature? Do you agree or disagree? Use evidence from your own experiences to support your claim.

### "To A Mouse"

- Comprehension: Students will annotate "To a Mouse" and determine Burns's thesis about power.
- Author's Methods: Characterization and Symbolism: Students will assess how Burns uses the characterization of the mouse and the farmer as symbols to further his ideas about power.
- Analysis: Write an analysis of Burns's "To a Mouse". What is his thesis about power? What evidence does he use to prove his point?
- Comparing Texts: How is Burns's thesis about power similar to Rousseau's? Compare and contrast the two texts in terms of their approaches to the similar theme.

### *Leviathan*

- Comprehension: Students will read through the excerpt from *Leviathan* and annotate the development of Hobbes's argument.
- Structure: How does Hobbes organize his argument? How does each section advance his argument?
- Comparing Texts: How are Hobbes's assertions about human nature different from Rousseau's? Go back to your significant moments from *The Social Contract*. Find significant moments in Hobbes that build a counterargument. How do these moments support the counterargument?

### "Dulce et Decorum Est"

- Comprehension: Determine Owen's thesis on human nature. Using textual evidence, explain in speech and writing how he builds his thesis.
- Author's Methods: Imagery: How does Owen use imagery to further his ideas about human nature?
- Analysis: Students will create a cartoon-strip representation of the poem. They will use lines from the poem as captions. For each cell, students must choose a significant moment from *Leviathan* and have one character in the cell think or say the lines to another character in the cell.
- Comparing Texts: Choose another group's cartoon representation of both texts. Analyze and explain how the group compared and contrasted the two authors' theses in the cartoon. Use evidence from the cartoon to support your analysis.

**Support for Culminating Task: Some students reading far below grade level may need additional help interpreting the text, “Hollow Men,” in order to show mastery of W.11-12.1. The following are some suggested scaffolds:**

“The Hollow Men”

- Comprehension: Students could annotate “The Hollow Men” to determine Eliot’s thesis about human nature.
- Author’s Methods: Characterization and Setting: Students could assess the setting and its effect on the hollow men. They should discuss whether the hollow men have constructed the setting and are the creators of their own torment, or if the setting has been imposed upon them by an outside force.
- Analysis: Students could write a paragraph comparing Eliot to either Hobbes or Rousseau. This paragraph would form the basis for their final paper.

**If these additional supports are given, the performance task will be a teaching tool for addressing RL.11-12.1 but will not assess independent mastery of this standard with this text, because students received support in understanding the text.**

**Additional Reading Support Strategies:** For students who need help understanding the various texts, consider having pairs or groups of students talk through and summarize each paragraph/stanza on whiteboards, then debrief as a class. The cartoon provides a creative forum for students who struggle with figurative language to construct something concrete about what they read. Infuse video throughout the unit to allow students to relate complicated ideas to visuals that are more easily understood than other complex texts.

#### **RESOURCES:**

- Hobbes, Thomas, and C. B. Macpherson. *Leviathan*. London: Penguin, 1988. Print. Chapter 23.
- Rousseau, Jean-Jacques. *The Social Contract and Other Later Political Writings*. Edited and translated by Victor Gourevitch. Cambridge, U.K.: Cambridge University Press, 1997. Part 1.
- Eliot, T.S. *Selected Poems*. Orlando, Florida: Harcourt Brace & Company, 1930. Print.
- Burns, Robert. “To A Mouse.” *Poetry X*. Ed. Jough Dempsey, August 25, 2004, accessed July 30, 2012, <http://poetry.poetryx.com/poems/4602/>.
- Owen, Wilfred. “Dulce Et Decorum Est.” *Poetry X*. Ed. Jough Dempsey, September 9, 2003, accessed July 30, 2012, <http://poetry.poetryx.com/poems/1150/>.

**Date:**

**Class:**

**Aim:**

Grade 11-12 ELA

How can we determine how Burns articulates his thesis about power?

**Background:**

- How does his lesson fit into the unit?  
- What went on before?  
- What happens next?

- This lesson is meant to help the students see connections between nonfiction and fiction texts.
- We want these lessons to be more interactive. To this end, we will be introducing a highly scaffolded version of Socratic Seminar.
- We want students to attend to the devices that poets use to get across ideas that can be seen in other genres of writing, such as philosophical treatises.

**NYS**

**Standard(s):**

-Standard 3: Students will read, write, listen, and speak for critical analysis and evaluation.

-Standard 4: Students will read, write, listen, and speak for social interaction.

**Common Core Standard(s):**

-RL.9-10.1. Cite strong and thorough textual evidence to support analysis of what the text says explicitly, as well as inferences drawn from the text.

-RL.9-10.2. Determine a theme or central idea of a text and analyze in detail its development over the course of the text, including how it emerges and is shaped and refined by specific details; provide an objective summary of the text.

-RL.9-10.3. Analyze how complex characters (e.g., those with multiple or conflicting motivations) develop over the course of a text, interact with other characters, and advance the plot or develop the theme.

-RL.9-10.4. Determine the meaning of words and phrases as they are used in the text, including figurative and connotative meanings; analyze the cumulative impact of specific word choices on meaning and tone (e.g., how the language evokes a sense of time and place; how it sets a formal or informal tone).

**Learning**

**Intention(s):**

Students will be able to identify how Burns develops his thesis about power using characterization and symbolism.

**Materials**

Copies of "To a Mouse" and *The Social Contract*

**Agenda:**

- What are students doing?  
- Why are they doing it?  
- Essential or pivotal questions  
- Mini lesson

1. Do Now: Describe a time when you were scared. What did you do? How did you act?

2. Debrief the Do Now:

⇒ Students will share their responses to the Do Now. The teacher will capture their answers on the board to use in the subsequent discussion.

3. First Read: Students will read "To a Mouse" together.

⇒ Circle unfamiliar words

⇒ Summarize stanzas in the margins

⇒ Put question marks next to things students do not understand

4. Second Read:

⇒ Students will highlight and analyze two examples of characterization for the farmer and two for the mouse.

⇒ Students will choose their top example to use for the Socratic Seminar.

5. Socratic Seminar:

⇒ Each student will need to share one significant moment and ask one question about someone else's example. If possible, each student will try to add or connect their example to the previous example by either showing how they agree or disagree with the previous student's analysis.

- ⇒ The teacher will guide the students to assess the symbolic significance of each character by asking: What is each character's relationship to power? Who has power? How do you know? How does Burns use symbolism to build his argument regarding power?

6. Third Read:

- ⇒ Students will choose what they consider to be the strongest pieces of evidence Burns provides to develop his thesis of power and will complete the chart with a partner.
- ⇒ Each pair will be asked to make a connection back to Rousseau. How does Burns's thesis on power relate to that of Rousseau's?

**Differentiation:**

- Differentiating content, process, or product
- Using data to create flexible groups
- Modifying based on IEPs

- By reading the text multiple times, students of all levels are able to refine their understanding of the text.
- By sharing vocabulary responsibilities as a class, students identify the words that are making comprehension difficult for them. Other students who can help the class define the words can take ownership of their own learning. Lastly, all students can appreciate how class community can contribute to individual learning.
- By engaging in the Socratic Seminar, all students can participate according to their comfort level, including those who would prefer to actively listen and provide a written summary of discussion for credit.

**Assessment:**

- Class discussion, chart, and written response

**Date:**  
**Class:**  
**Aim:**

Grade 11-12 ELA

How can we draw connections between “Dulce et Decorum Est” and *Leviathan* through an exploration of the use of imagery?

**Background:**

- How does his lesson fit into the unit?  
- What went on before?  
- What happens next?

- Now that students have had a chance to grapple with the ideas contained in Hobbes’s *Leviathan*, students will practice juxtaposing Hobbes’s ideas about war with Wilfred Owen’s ideas contained in his poem, “Dulce et Decorum Est”.
- Students will practice their three-phase process of reading for the gist, selecting significant moments, and evaluating the effects of literary techniques on author’s purpose.
- Students will construct their own cartoon images connecting Hobbes and Owen after analyzing both authors’ views of war. We have added in this component to help students make connections between authors in a different (and more interactive) way, and to engage our creative students. We hope that the students will have fun with the project and use it as a forum for more in-depth analysis.

**NYS Standard(s):**

- Standard 3: Students will read, write, listen, and speak for critical analysis and evaluation.
- Standard 4: Students will read, write, listen, and speak for social interaction.

**Common Core Standard(s):**

- RL.9-10.1. Cite strong and thorough textual evidence to support analysis of what the text says explicitly, as well as inferences drawn from the text.
- RL.9-10.2. Determine a theme or central idea of a text and analyze in detail its development over the course of the text, including how it emerges and is shaped and refined by specific details; provide an objective summary of the text.
- RL.9-10.4. Determine the meaning of words and phrases as they are used in the text, including figurative and connotative meanings; analyze the cumulative impact of specific word choices on meaning and tone (e.g., how the language evokes a sense of time and place; how it sets a formal or informal tone).
- RL.9-10.7. Analyze the representation of a subject or a key scene in two different artistic mediums, including what is emphasized or absent in each treatment (e.g., Auden’s “Musée des Beaux Arts” and Breughel’s *Landscape with the Fall of Icarus*).

**Learning Intention(s):**

Students will be able to choose significant moments from the text that connect to Hobbes’s *Leviathan* and represent those connections in an artistic way.

**Materials**

Copies of “Dulce et Decorum Est”, *Leviathan* and copies of project, cartoon model

**Agenda:**

- What are students doing?  
- Why are they doing it?  
- Essential or pivotal questions  
- Mini lesson

1. Do Now: List two positive and two negative outcomes of war. Do the positives outweigh the negatives enough to justify war? Why or why not?
2. Think-Pair-Share:  
After students have thought out their viewpoints on paper for the Do Now, they will pair up with a member of their group and share their responses. Then the class as a whole will discuss the subject of war using some of the following questions to stimulate conversation:
  - ⇒ Why do we go to war? What do we hope to gain?
  - ⇒ How does Hobbes define war? Do you agree or disagree with his assessment of it?
  - ⇒ Do you think Hobbes is arguing against war? Why or why not?
3. First read:
  - ⇒ Class will read through Owen’s poem once, trying to understand the gist of the poem.

- ⇒ Groups will discuss how to summarize poem and write their summary on their whiteboards.
- ⇒ Teacher will ask:
  - What do you think Owen's thesis about war is?
  - How do you know?

#### 4. Second Read:

- ⇒ Teacher will ask the class to go back through the poem and circle any imagery that the author uses.
- ⇒ Teacher will clarify misconception about imagery. Authors use imagery not only to help us visualize what it is they are talking about, but also to visualize it in a very specific way. This is one way that authors create **mood**: the atmosphere that pervades a literary work with the intention of evoking a certain emotion or feeling from the audience.
- ⇒ Teacher will list imagery students identified on the board and ask the students to identify what they believe the overall mood of the poem is.
- ⇒ Teacher will then ask groups to discuss how mood and imagery support Owen's thesis.
- ⇒ Each student should choose one image and complete the significant moments chart for that image. This quote will also serve as the foundation of their comic. Students should evaluate how mood and imagery support Owen's thesis.

#### 5. Making Connections:

- ⇒ Students will each choose a quote from Hobbes that speaks to the image that they captured from "Dulce et Decorum Est" in the second read.
  - The quote should speak to the message about war that is conveyed through the image in "Dulce et Decorum Est".
- ⇒ The teacher will ask the students to make connections between *Leviathan* and "Dulce et Decorum Est". Students should use the quotes as a forum for this discussion.

#### 6. Creative Project:

- ⇒ The teacher will review the project with the class. Students will construct a cartoon that depicts the action in "Dulce et Decorum Est" using the quotes that their group selected above. The directions are as follows:
  - Each group member will be responsible for creating one cell of the cartoon.
  - Each cell should have:
    - an image,
    - a subtitle (the quote from "Dulce et Decorum Est"),
    - and a thought or word bubble (a quote from *Leviathan* that connects to the chosen scene).
  - Students should use color, graphics, symbols, etc. to illustrate the scene.
  - When students have finished, assemble the class's work into one cartoon. Students will need to tape their work together, title their work, and add one big image to tie all of the cells together.
  - Each cell will be worth 25 points. Student's grade will be out of 100%. Students should note that they will be graded for their creativity and ability to connect and illustrate ideas from "Dulce et Decorum Est" and *Leviathan*, not their artistic ability.
- ⇒ The teacher will share the model with the class. The model connects "To a Mouse" and *The Social Contract*.
  - Discuss how the quotes connect.
  - Review images, colors, etc. How do these add up to a message about strength?
- ⇒ Students will work in groups to construct their cartoon.

#### 7. Share-Out: Gallery Walk: Posters will be hung around the room.

- ⇒ Students will re-convene in their cartoon groups at their poster.

- ⇒ They will spend two minutes at each poster. The teacher will time their progress and tell the groups when to move.
- ⇒ Once the students have visited each poster, each individual member will choose their favorite cell from all of the students' work.
- ⇒ Students will fill out the Gallery Walk debrief sheet based on their favorite cell.
  - The teacher will review the model with the students and discuss how to fill out the sheets. The teacher should stress the use of evidence in the explanation.
- ⇒ Debrief:
  - The teacher will elicit the following information from the students: similarities, commonalities, striking images, etc.
  - The teacher will ask for volunteers to read some of their Gallery Walk feedback and for students to share some of their favorite images.

### **Differentiation:**

- Differentiating content, process, or product
- Using data to create flexible groups
- Modifying based on IEPs

- If students have difficulty with identifying the mood of the poem, teacher will ask for students to list synonyms for each of the images. Teacher will ask class if the synonym is a more positive or more negative take on the same image. Teacher will group words accordingly on board. Then teacher will ask students to name positive moods or feelings and negative moods or feelings. Students will then be asked to decide which of the moods they listed best fit the imagery used in the poem.
- By reading the text multiple times, students of all levels are able to refine their understanding of the text.
- By sharing vocabulary responsibilities as a class, students identify the words that are making comprehension difficult for them. Other students who can help the class define the words can take ownership of their own learning. Lastly, all students can appreciate how class community can contribute to individual learning.
- Chunking text will help lower level students make sense of the text.
- Students will be able to choose their own cell to debrief for the Gallery Walk.

### **Assessment:**

- Class discussion, annotations, student handouts, creative projects

The lesson provides options to support struggling students: teachers are suggested to generate lists of synonyms for the images and to present the text to the students in “chunks” to foster comprehension.



**Date:**

**Class:**

**Aim:** Grade 11-12 ELA  
How can we compare and contrast how authors convey their viewpoints on human nature?

**Background:**

- How does his lesson fit into the unit?  
- What went on before?  
- What happens next?

- Students need to be able to parse the nuances between Hobbes and Rousseau in order to effectively tackle their final assessment.
- We will also be starting to examine “The Hollow Men” in a first read. As this poem is extremely difficult, we will be doing more than one reading. As we assess student progress, we will decide how interactive to make the reading of the poem. Ideas include: whiteboards, acting the poem out, debate/philosophical chairs, etc. This lesson includes directions for all three readings.

**NYS**

**Standard(s):**

-Standard 3: Students will read, write, listen, and speak for critical analysis and evaluation.

-Standard 4: Students will read, write, listen, and speak for social interaction.

**Common Core Standard(s):**

- RI.9-10.5. Analyze in detail how an author’s ideas or claims are developed and refined by particular sentences, paragraphs, or larger portions of a text (e.g., a section or chapter).
- RL.9-10.1. Cite strong and thorough textual evidence to support analysis of what the text says explicitly, as well as inferences drawn from the text.
- RL.9-10.2. Determine a theme or central idea of a text and analyze in detail its development over the course of the text, including how it emerges and is shaped and refined by specific details; provide an objective summary of the text.
- RL.9-10.3. Analyze how complex characters (e.g., those with multiple or conflicting motivations) develop over the course of a text, interact with other characters, and advance the plot or develop the theme.
- RL.9-10.4. Determine the meaning of words and phrases as they are used in the text, including figurative and connotative meanings; analyze the cumulative impact of specific word choices on meaning and tone (e.g., how the language evokes a sense of time and place; how it sets a formal or informal tone).

**Learning Intention(s):**

Students will be able to identify authors’ theses on the theme of human nature and to define how each author built his thesis.

**Materials**

Copies of comparison worksheet and “The Hollow Men” worksheet

**Agenda:**

- What are students doing?  
- Why are they doing it?  
- Essential or pivotal questions  
- Mini lesson

1. Question 26
  - ⇒ Students will work in groups to complete a Question 26 paragraph comparing and contrasting Hobbes and Rousseau with a focus on human nature.
  - ⇒ Students should check in with the teacher once they finish an initial draft then write a final draft onto chart paper.
2. Share-Out
  - ⇒ Students will share their work with the class. We will use the Question 26 rubric to assess each group’s work.
  - ⇒ We will work to discuss distinctions between Rousseau and Hobbes as well as commonalities. This discussion will be invaluable as we move toward work on “The Hollow Men”.
3. “The Hollow Men”
  - ⇒ **First Read:** Read the poem and annotate the plot in the margins.
    - PART 1: We meet the hollow men. They are lost souls, compared to scarecrows...;

men are hollow; we have lost purpose, identity, etc.

- We will read the first section together in the margins. Students will perform a choral reading of the stanzas. They should be aware of the narrator or, in this case, the narrators.
- Students will work through the difficult language of the first section and take notes on “the plot”.
- Students will be encouraged to discuss multiple interpretations: the hollow men as scarecrows, as men who have been hollowed out by society, as men who need society in order to be full.
- Students will be encouraged to make connections between the poem and popular culture: zombie movies, end of the world movies, etc.
- For Part 1, teacher will ask questions like:
  - What has made these men hollow?
  - Are they actually “hollow?” What might be the larger thematic connotations of their state?
  - Why are their heads filled with straw?
  - Why have multiple narrators (the hollow men) instead of one narrator (the hollow man)?
  - Why would these men be lost souls?
  - Do you think that they want to go to death’s other kingdom? Why or why not? Why are they not allowed to travel on?
- PART 2: The narrator switches from “the hollow men” to a hollow man; we see the motif of eyes (identity?); the setting becomes death’s dream kingdom (what has changed that now they are allowed entrance? Notice that it is a dream and all as surreal); distant singing like a fading star, a tree swinging, and sunlight on a broken column all speak to a sense of isolation; the hollow man wants to be disguised here; the speaker is afraid of what is ahead.
  - For Part 2, teacher will ask questions like:
    - Why switch the narrative voice?
    - What might the eyes represent?
    - Where is the hollow man? How is the dream kingdom characterized?
    - How does the hollow man feel about this place? How do you know?
- PART 3: The hollow man describes death’s dream kingdom: “dead land, cactus land”; the hollow man wants a connection (“lips that would kiss”), but only gets “prayers to a broken stone”.
  - For Part 3, teacher will ask questions like:
    - Why does the hollow man call death’s dream kingdom the cactus land?
    - What is the significance of the fading star (hope is dissipating with the light)?
    - Why does the hollow man want a connection at this point in the story? Why isn’t he able to make one?
- PART 4: The stars are dying, like hope; the eyes have disappeared; their kingdoms have become lost and a hollow valley (signifies that the kingdom was not always a hollow valley, but it is lost); it is dark and the hollow men grope together, but they do not speak or truly connect; the men hope for stars or eyes (God?), but get nothing.
  - For Part 4, teacher will ask questions like:
    - Why have the eyes disappeared? What is the significance?
    - Why would this section of the poem be dark?
    - Can the hollow men bring the light back? Why or why not? How do you know?

- Why do they want the eyes to come back after avoiding them earlier in the poem?
- PART 5: Begins with a children's rhyme with a play on "here we go round the mulberry bush"; perhaps the light might come back with the call for "five o'clock in the morning?" Between all ideas and reality is the Shadow, which is even between the prayers of the hollow men; describes the end of the world "not with a bang, but a whimper".
  - For Part 5, teacher will ask questions like:
    - Why begin with a nursery rhyme?
    - Why repeat the idea of the Shadow?
    - How does the world end?
    - Is there any room for hope at the end of the poem? Have the hollow men finally connected in the song?

⇒ **Second Read:** Identify significant moments that reveal the characterization of the hollow men and that reveal setting. Find two quotes that reveal aspects of the hollow men (yellow) and two for the setting (pink) and highlight them. Annotate key details in the margins for each highlight. Focus on understanding the relationship between the two.

- The teacher will help the students to grapple with the following questions:
  - Who or what made these men hollow?
    - Society?
    - The men themselves?
    - The absence of functional society?
  - What is the significance of the setting in the poem? Can the setting be changed? Should we take it literally?
  - What is the larger message at the end of the poem? Does the world truly end or is this a cautionary tale?
  - Is there any hope for the hollow men?

⇒ **Third Read:** Read through the poem. Determine Eliot's thesis about human nature. Highlight at least three pieces of evidence that reveal his argument in green.

- The teacher will help the students to decide:
  - What is Eliot's message about human nature in "The Hollow Men?"
  - Who does Eliot most resemble: Hobbes or Rousseau?
  - What evidence can we use to make this comparison?

#### **Differentiation:**

- Differentiating content, process, or product
- Using data to create flexible groups
- Modifying based on IEPs

- Students will be able to work in groups on the writing process to gain extra support.
- There will be several checks throughout the class so that students who are less comfortable with the material will be able to hear their peers' work.
- Students will be able to choose their own evidence for each philosopher, both independently and then after hearing from their peers.
- Students will be able to make multiple interpretations of "The Hollow Men" based on their understanding of the poem.

#### **Assessment:**

- Class discussion, annotations, student handouts

Below are two outlines teachers could share with students. The first is appropriate for supporting more advanced students. The second is appropriate for supporting struggling students.

#### Outline for Argument Essay

- I. Introduction: Introduce the topic and state or explain the question.
- II. Body Paragraph One: Present your case.
- III. Body Paragraph Two: Refute or disprove the opposing position.

Conclusion: The conclusion of this format is a restatement of your claim and a summary of the information that supports it.

Below you will find a detailed outline for your paper. Use the directions here as a guide as you write your essay.

#### Outline for Argument Essay

- I. Introduction
  - a. Identify Eliot's thesis about human nature and provide one or two examples.
  - b. Thesis: Which Enlightenment thinker does Eliot most resemble? Why?
- II. Body Paragraph One (Claim)
  - a. Topic Sentence: Which Enlightenment thinker does Eliot most resemble? Why? Identify the thesis or controlling idea about human nature here.
  - b. Identify one way in which the Enlightenment thinker and Eliot are similar.
    - i. Identify one example from the Enlightenment thinker and one from Eliot. Explain how their thinking is similar.
  - c. Identify another way in which the Enlightenment thinker and Eliot are similar.
    - i. Identify another example from the Enlightenment thinker and another from Eliot. Explain how their thinking is similar.
- III. Body Paragraph Two (Counterclaim)
  - a. Topic Sentence: How might somebody argue that the other Enlightenment thinker resembles Eliot? Why are they wrong?
  - b. Identify one way in which the Enlightenment thinker and Eliot may be considered to be similar, but are actually different.
    - i. Identify one example from the Enlightenment thinker and one from Eliot. Explain how their thinking is different.
  - c. Optional: Identify a second way in which the Enlightenment thinker and Eliot may be considered to be similar, but is actually different.
    - i. Identify another example from the Enlightenment thinker and another from Eliot. Explain how their thinking is different.

Conclusion: Restatement of claim (Which Enlightenment thinker does Eliot most resemble? Why?) and summary of the main ideas.

This resource could be provided to students at the start of the unit, or presented with the writings of Rousseau and Hobbes. Encouraging students to utilize the vocabulary of the Enlightenment in their writing would be a strong next step in ensuring systematic opportunities to utilize academic vocabulary.

## The Vocabulary of the Enlightenment

| Term                | Textbook Definition | Your Definition |
|---------------------|---------------------|-----------------|
| infallible          |                     |                 |
| geocentric          |                     |                 |
| heliocentric        |                     |                 |
| natural law         |                     |                 |
| natural rights      |                     |                 |
| social contract     |                     |                 |
| laissez-faire       |                     |                 |
| divine right        |                     |                 |
| feudalism           |                     |                 |
| enlightened despots |                     |                 |
| general will        |                     |                 |
| bourgeoisie         |                     |                 |
| nobility            |                     |                 |
| aristocracy         |                     |                 |
| radical             |                     |                 |
| abdicate            |                     |                 |
| censorship          |                     |                 |

**Thomas Hobbes: *Leviathan*, Chapter XIII, 1651**

**and**

**Jean Jacques Rousseau: *The Social Contract*, Part I, 1762**

**Directions:** For the first read of *Leviathan* and *The Social Contract*, practice the chunking technique below for paragraphs that are hard to follow.

**Chunking Technique:**

❖ For each paragraph:

- Number sentences in the paragraph.

❖ For each long sentence:

- Break up the text according to punctuation by writing a slash after each comma, parentheses, and/or semicolon.
- Circle words you do not know. If you can understand the gist of the sentence without the word, ignore it.
- Try to paraphrase the text in between each slash. Take notes in the margins.
- \*\*For parentheses, read the sentence without the parentheses first.\*\*

Name: \_\_\_\_\_

**“To A Mouse”**  
***On turning her up in her nest with the plough***  
**Robert Burns**  
November 1785

**Directions:**

- First Read: Read the poem and annotate the plot in the margins.
  - Second Read: Identify significant moments that reveal the characterization of the mouse and the farmer. Find two quotes that reveal aspects of the mouse and two for the farmer. Focus on understanding the relationship between the two characters.
  - Third Read: Read through the poem. Determine Burns’s thesis about power. Annotate at least three pieces of evidence that reveal his argument. (See following page)
-

Name: \_\_\_\_\_

## **“To a Mouse” Significant Moments**

**Directions:** After you have annotated three pieces of evidence that reveal Burns’s argument about power, choose your best quote and fill out the chart below.

| <b>Quote: Choose one quote from “To A Mouse” that reveals Burns’s thesis about power.</b> | <b>Analysis: What does this quote reveal about Burns’s views of power? Make sure you explain your points.</b> | <b>Connections: Connect Burns’s ideas about power to Rousseau. Would these two men agree? Why or why not?</b> |
|---|---|---|
|   |   |   |



Name: \_\_\_\_\_

## “To A Mouse”

Write an analysis of Burns's "To a Mouse." What is his thesis about power? What evidence does he use to prove his point? How do his views on power relate to Rousseau? You should use at least two examples to support your assertions.

[illegible]

Name: \_\_\_\_\_

## Deconstructing Wilfred Owen's "Dulce et Decorum Est"

**Aim:** How can we draw connections between "Dulce et Decorum Est" and *Leviathan* through an exploration of imagery?

**Learning Intention:** You will identify, analyze, and construct images to explore Hobbes's and Owen's views of the brutality of war.

**First Read:** What is going on? Summarize the action of the poem in two sentences. Please make sure to take all stanzas into account.

### Notes on "Dulce et Decorum Est"

DULCE ET DECORUM EST: The first words of a Latin saying (taken from an ode by Horace). The words were widely understood and often quoted at the start of the First World War. They mean "it is sweet and right". The full saying ends the poem: *Dulce et decorum est pro patria mori* ("It is sweet and right to die for your country"). In other words, it is a wonderful and great honor to fight and die for your country.

**Second Read:** How does Owen communicate the brutality of war and man's natural state through his use of imagery? Choose one quote from "Dulce et Decorum Est" that answers this question. Everyone in the group should have a different quote and explanation.

| <b>Quote:</b> Choose a quote from "Dulce et Decorum Est" that illustrates the brutality of war. | <b>Line Number(s)</b> | <b>Explanation:</b> Which words in the quote help to reveal an image about violence? How do these words lead to a message about the brutality of war? |
|---|-----------------------|---|
|   |                       |   |

**Making Connections:**

Find one quote from *Leviathan* that connects to the image you chose from “Dulce et Decorum Est”. Write your quote below:

---

---

---

---

Connect the ideas in Hobbes’s *Leviathan* back to your quote from “Dulce et Decorum Est”. How does Owen use ideas from Hobbes in his writing? Be as specific as possible.

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

**Creative Project:** Construct a cartoon that depicts the action in “Dulce et Decorum Est” using the quotes that your group selected above.

**The Specifics:**

- Each group member will be responsible for creating one cell of the cartoon.
- Each cell should have:
  - an image,
  - a subtitle (the quote from “Dulce et Decorum Est”),
  - and a thought or word bubble (a quote from *Leviathan* that connects to your scene).
- You should use color, graphics, symbols, etc. to illustrate the scene.
- When you have finished, assemble everyone’s work into one cartoon. You will need to tape your work together.
- Each cell will be worth 25 points. Your grade will be out of 100%. Note that you will be graded for your creativity and ability to connect and illustrate ideas from “Dulce et Decorum Est” and *Leviathan*, not your artistic ability.

**Grading:**

|         | A  | B  | C  | D  | F   |
|---------|--|--|--|--|---|
| Image 1 | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- You chose a quote from “Dulce et Decorum Est” that masterfully illustrates how Owen uses imagery to illustrate the brutality of war.</li> <li>- You chose a quote from <i>Leviathan</i> that clearly connects to Owen’s ideas.</li> <li>- Your illustration captures the ideas from both authors.</li> <li>- You used colors, images, and words in a strategic and meaningful way.</li> </ul> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- You chose a quote from “Dulce et Decorum Est” that illustrates how Owen uses imagery to illustrate the brutality of war.</li> <li>- You chose a quote from <i>Leviathan</i> that clearly connects to Owen’s ideas.</li> <li>- Your illustration captures the ideas from both authors.</li> <li>- You used colors, images, and words in a meaningful way.</li> </ul> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- You chose a quote from “Dulce et Decorum Est” that illustrates how Owen uses imagery to illustrate the brutality of war.</li> <li>- You chose a quote from <i>Leviathan</i> that clearly connects to Owen’s ideas.</li> <li>- One of your quotes is better than the other.</li> <li>- Your illustration captures the ideas from both authors.</li> <li>- You tried to use colors, images, and words in a strategic and meaningful way.</li> </ul> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- You chose a quote from “Dulce et Decorum Est” that somewhat illustrates how Owen uses imagery to illustrate the brutality of war.</li> <li>- You chose a quote from <i>Leviathan</i> that somewhat connects to Owen’s ideas.</li> <li>- Your illustration somewhat captures the ideas from both authors.</li> <li>- You tried to use colors, images, and words, but you needed to add more detail.</li> </ul> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- You did not incorporate one quote for each author.</li> <li>- Your quotes were off-topic.</li> <li>- Your image shows a lack of preparation or is unfinished.</li> </ul> |
|         | 25 24 23   | 22 21  | 19 18  | 17 16  | 14  |
| Image 2 | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- You chose a quote from “Dulce et Decorum Est” that masterfully illustrates how Owen uses imagery to illustrate the brutality of war.</li> <li>- You chose a quote from <i>Leviathan</i> that clearly connects to Owen’s ideas.</li> <li>- Your illustration captures the ideas from both authors.</li> <li>- You used colors, images, and words in a strategic and meaningful way.</li> </ul> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- You chose a quote from “Dulce et Decorum Est” that illustrates how Owen uses imagery to illustrate the brutality of war.</li> <li>- You chose a quote from <i>Leviathan</i> that clearly connects to Owen’s ideas.</li> <li>- Your illustration captures the ideas from both authors.</li> <li>- You used colors, images, and words in a meaningful way.</li> </ul> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- You chose a quote from “Dulce et Decorum Est” that illustrates how Owen uses imagery to illustrate the brutality of war.</li> <li>- You chose a quote from <i>Leviathan</i> that clearly connects to Owen’s ideas.</li> <li>- One of your quotes is better than the other.</li> <li>- Your illustration captures the ideas from both authors.</li> <li>- You tried to use colors, images, and words in a strategic and meaningful way.</li> </ul> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- You chose a quote from “Dulce et Decorum Est” that somewhat illustrates how Owen uses imagery to illustrate the brutality of war.</li> <li>- You chose a quote from <i>Leviathan</i> that somewhat connects to Owen’s ideas.</li> <li>- Your illustration somewhat captures the ideas from both authors.</li> <li>- You tried to use colors, images, and words, but you needed to add more detail.</li> </ul> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- You did not incorporate one quote for each author.</li> <li>- Your quotes were off-topic.</li> <li>- Your image shows a lack of preparation or is unfinished.</li> </ul> |
|         | 25 24 23   | 22 21  | 19 18  | 17 16  | 14  |

|         | A  | B  | C  | D  | F   |
|---------|--|--|--|--|---|
| Image 3 | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- You chose a quote from “Dulce et Decorum Est” that masterfully illustrates how Owen uses imagery to illustrate the brutality of war.</li> <li>- You chose a quote from <i>Leviathan</i> that clearly connects to Owen’s ideas.</li> <li>- Your illustration captures the ideas from both authors.</li> <li>- You used colors, images, and words in a strategic and meaningful way.</li> </ul> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- You chose a quote from “Dulce et Decorum Est” that illustrates how Owen uses imagery to illustrate the brutality of war.</li> <li>- You chose a quote from <i>Leviathan</i> that clearly connects to Owen’s ideas.</li> <li>- Your illustration captures the ideas from both authors.</li> <li>- You used colors, images, and words in a meaningful way.</li> </ul> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- You chose a quote from “Dulce et Decorum Est” that illustrates how Owen uses imagery to illustrate the brutality of war.</li> <li>- You chose a quote from <i>Leviathan</i> that clearly connects to Owen’s ideas.</li> <li>- One of your quotes is better than the other.</li> <li>- Your illustration captures the ideas from both authors.</li> <li>- You tried to use colors, images, and words in a strategic and meaningful way.</li> </ul> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- You chose a quote from “Dulce et Decorum Est” that somewhat illustrates how Owen uses imagery to illustrate the brutality of war.</li> <li>- You chose a quote from <i>Leviathan</i> that somewhat connects to Owen’s ideas.</li> <li>- Your illustration somewhat captures the ideas from both authors.</li> <li>- You tried to use colors, images, and words, but you needed to add more detail.</li> </ul> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- You did not incorporate one quote for each author.</li> <li>- Your quotes were off-topic.</li> <li>- Your image shows a lack of preparation or is unfinished.</li> </ul> |
|         | 25 24 23   | 22 21  | 19 18  | 17 16  | 14  |
| Image 4 | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- You chose a quote from “Dulce et Decorum Est” that masterfully illustrates how Owen uses imagery to illustrate the brutality of war.</li> <li>- You chose a quote from <i>Leviathan</i> that clearly connects to Owen’s ideas.</li> <li>- Your illustration captures the ideas from both authors.</li> <li>- You used colors, images, and words in a strategic and meaningful way.</li> </ul> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- You chose a quote from “Dulce et Decorum Est” that illustrates how Owen uses imagery to illustrate the brutality of war.</li> <li>- You chose a quote from <i>Leviathan</i> that clearly connects to Owen’s ideas.</li> <li>- Your illustration captures the ideas from both authors.</li> <li>- You used colors, images, and words in a meaningful way.</li> </ul> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- You chose a quote from “Dulce et Decorum Est” that illustrates how Owen uses imagery to illustrate the brutality of war.</li> <li>- You chose a quote from <i>Leviathan</i> that clearly connects to Owen’s ideas.</li> <li>- One of your quotes is better than the other.</li> <li>- Your illustration captures the ideas from both authors.</li> <li>- You tried to use colors, images, and words in a strategic and meaningful way.</li> </ul> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- You chose a quote from “Dulce et Decorum Est” that somewhat illustrates how Owen uses imagery to illustrate the brutality of war.</li> <li>- You chose a quote from <i>Leviathan</i> that somewhat connects to Owen’s ideas.</li> <li>- Your illustration somewhat captures the ideas from both authors.</li> <li>- You tried to use colors, images, and words, but you needed to add more detail.</li> </ul> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- You did not incorporate one quote for each author.</li> <li>- Your quotes were off-topic.</li> <li>- Your image shows a lack of preparation or is unfinished.</li> </ul> |
|         | 25 24 23   | 22 21  | 19 18  | 17 16  | 14  |

Name: \_\_\_\_\_

## “The Hollow Men”

T.S. Eliot

1925

### Directions:

- **First Read:** Read the poem and annotate the plot in the margins.
- **Second Read:** Identify significant moments that reveal the characterization of the hollow men and that reveal setting. Find two quotes that reveal aspects of the hollow men (yellow) and two for the setting (pink) and highlight them. Annotate key details in the margins for each annotation. Focus on understanding the relationship between the two.
- **Third Read:** Read through the poem. Determine Eliot’s thesis about human nature. Highlight at least three pieces of evidence that reveal his argument in green.

---

### “The Hollow Men”

Write an analysis of Eliot’s “The Hollow Men”. What is his thesis about human nature? What evidence does he use to prove his point? How do his views on human nature relate to Rousseau and Hobbes? Which philosopher do you feel he most resembles? You should use at least two examples to support your assertions.

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

[illegible]